

(p.318), erroneously, that "post-Independence governments have not committed themselves to any clear-cut policy on language. In November 1986 the Ministerial Committee Report outlined a philosophy of education for PNG. This policy, which has been adopted by Cabinet and is now used widely throughout the country, was a result of the work of Sir Paulias Matane (Chairman) and members of the Ministerial Review Committee. There were 23 recommendations and number 13 directly changed the course of future education: "that the vernacular language be used as the medium of instruction in the early years of schooling and English be used in later years" (p.48). Since June 1989 the government has actively supported and encouraged this policy (Robert Litteral, personal communication).

LED is a well documented study of certain types of TP linguistic variation with supporting data. However, the average reader will find it heavy with syntactic argumentation on such variation as well as polemic about the role of the missions and the colonial government in PNG.

References

- A philosophy of education for Papua New Guinea.* Ministerial Committee Report. November 1986.
- Bickerton, Derek. 1988. Creole languages and the bioprogram. In *Linguistic theory: Extensions and implications*, vol. 2 of *Linguistics: The Cambridge survey*, ed. by F. J. Newmeyer, 268-84. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Keesing, Roger. 1968. *Melanesian Pidgin and the Oceanic substrate*. Stanford: Stanford University Press
- Mühlhäusler, Peter. 1988. Writing systems for the languages of the Pacific. ms.
- Romaine, Suzanne. 1992. The inclusive/exclusive distinction in Tok Pisin. *Language and Linguistics in Melanesia* 23:1-11.

Variation and convergence: studies in social dialectology. Edited by Peter Auer and Aldo di Luzio. Sociolinguistics and Language Contact no.4. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1988. vii + 320 pp. A\$142.50.

Reviewed by Jeff Siegel
University of New England

This volume presents what the editors call "a new approach to variation and convergence" (p.7) in social dialectology. The philosophy behind the approach, outlined in the introduction, follows that of other sociolinguists (such as Le Page and Tabouret-Keller 1985) in advocating the examination of performance to see if there is any focussed variety rather than starting with the assumption that there is a "code" and that variation is incidental. The editors point out that variation or "linguistic diversity" is an important source of data in its own right, not simply to show relationships between ways of speaking and social status or class (as in Labovian correlational sociolinguistics), but to understand the meaning that these ways of speaking have to members of the speech community.

As indicated by the title, the book also concentrates on convergence (and its opposite, divergence). This notion has two separate but related meanings. The first comes from accommodation theory of social psychology and refers to the process in face-to-face interaction of adjusting one's speech to that of another, either making it more similar (convergence), or emphasizing differences (divergence). The editors point out that few if any "fine-grain interactional and grammatical analyses" (p.4) have been done

on this notion. For example, they say that while we know vertical convergence occurs (between a standard and nonstandard dialects), we don't know whether horizontal convergence occurs as well (for instance between nonstandard dialects). Also, we have little knowledge of exactly how convergence occurs in actual conversation.

The second use of the term "convergence" refers to a more macro-level phenomenon where languages in contact influence changes in each other, as in the well known description of Kupwar, India by Gumperz and Wilson (1971). Just how and why these changes occur is an important theoretical question, which can be approached from the point of view of both sociolinguistics, for example in using social network analysis, and phonological theory, for example in applying Natural Phonology. Another aspect of macro-level convergence which needs to be examined, according to the editors, is the possible development of "intermediate varieties", such as koines.

Besides outlining these concerns in the introduction, the editors also discuss methodology. They make it clear that modern social dialectologists must deal with individual variation, thus interviewing more informants and also abandoning the notion of the isogloss. In sum, they advocate the integration of qualitative and quantitative sociolinguistics.

The twelve contributions in the volume use various aspects of this approach in a variety of sociolinguistic situations. The first five are concerned with dialects of German, beginning with "On the interpretive analysis of historical records: linguistic relations in seventeenth century Osnabrück". The author, Utz Maas, attempts a "historical sociology of language" (p.12), using de-

tailed analysis of legal and literary texts to examine the spread of features of an early form of High German. The next chapter, "A case of convergence and its interpretation: M[iddle] H[igh] G[erman] *i* and *ü* in the city dialect of Constance" by Peter Auer, also looks at the apparent spread of dialectal features in German, but concentrates on particular phonological features in a modern urban dialect. The combination of quantitative and interpretive methods used in this excellent study exemplifies the approach outlined in the introduction. Instead of merely stating correspondences between linguistic forms in various regions, as previously done in dialectology, the author attempts to explain linguistic change according to a theory of convergence as well as according to generally occurring phonological processes of change.

In "Sociophonology", Sylvia Moosmüller examines the Viennese dialect of German in the same vein by looking at the interaction of phonetics, phonology and sociolinguistics. Her sociophonological model combines elements of Natural Phonology and sociolinguistic variation studies.

The "communicative dialectology" aspect of the new approach is illustrated by Iwar Werlen in an investigation of conversational dialect variation in "Swiss German dialects and Swiss Standard High German". The following chapter by J. Peter French, uses similar methods of conversational analysis but concentrates on a single variable and in English rather than in German: "Word final /r/ in a northern English accent: an interactional account of variable production".

The next chapter returns to Switzerland, with Otto Stern reporting on a study of standard language acquisition by Swiss-German dialect speaking children, again using spontaneous conversational data. This study, entitled "Divergence and convergence of dialect and standard from the perspective of the language learner", would be of interest to scholars of second language and second dialect acquisition. "Convergence, discourse and variation" by Norbert Dittmar and Peter Schlobinski, which follows, goes back to German dialects, this time looking at data recorded in Berlin and again emphasizing conversational variation caused by convergence.

The next three chapters are concerned with Italian dialects. The first of these, by Frank Müller, is entitled: "Uncodified code: a look at some properties of the dialects of Sicily and a presentation of one speaker". The "properties" outlined are related to the fact that the Sicilian dialects are entirely oral and not written codes. As indicated by the title, the chapter also includes data from a detailed analysis of one speaker. In "Conversational microconvergences between dialect and language",

Alberto A. Sobrero looks at phonological convergence in the Salento area, using social network analysis to explain in part various conversation strategies. John Trumper and Marta Maddalon then present a lengthy study looking at various outcomes of contact between dialects in different regions of Italy: "Converging divergence and diverging convergence: the dialect-language conflict and contrasting evolutionary changes in modern Italy". Their research has important implications for historical linguistics as well as sociolinguistics.

The final two contributions to the book are about non-European situations. Werner Enninger and Joachim Raith describe "Varieties, variation and convergence in the linguistic repertoire of the Old Order Amish in Kent Country, Delaware". Here, rather than convergence between dialects, we see evidence of the influence of American English on Pennsylvania German. The final chapter is "Standardization processes and linguistic repertoires in Africa and Europe: some comparative remarks". The author, Alberto M. Mioni, presents a brief survey of standard languages and other languages of wider communication in Africa. His comparison with the European situation is an important reminder that sociolinguistic work in Europe and America is not necessarily generalizable to other regions.

In general this collection is well presented but there are several lapses which are surprising considering the prestige of the publisher (and the cost of the book!). These include some editing oversights such as referring to a "following table" (p.160) which actually occurs on the preceding page. But a totally inexcusable flaw is that the ordering of the contributions described in the introduction differs from the actual order in the book. It is often difficult to find a way to group diverse studies together in some coherent fashion, and it appears that a last minute change was made in the ordering, although the rationale behind it is not clear.

Most of the contributions in this volume generally do fit together, however, because they illustrate various aspects of the approach outlined in the introduction. One of the general failings of the collection with regard to content, though, is that convergence at the macro level is not clearly distinguished from other outcomes of language contact. The term convergence implies that two or more dialects or languages influence one another so that they each change in the direction of the others. However, in Enninger and Raith's chapter on the Old Order Amish, for example, we find change in one direction referred to as convergence. American English is influencing the Pennsylvania German of the community, but not the reverse

(p.279). It would not be useful to apply the term "convergence" to any contact-induced linguistic change.

Another weakness is that some of the content of this volume has been superseded by earlier publications. For example, Dittmar and Schlobinski say (p.157): "In the current state of sociolinguistics there is no clear concept of the role of convergence as a source of sociolinguistic variation." However, at the time this collection was published Peter Trudgill's important work on this topic, *Dialects in Contact* (1986), had been out for two years. This can be explained by the fact that most of the contributions to the volume are based on papers from the workshop "Interpretive Sociolinguistics II", held in Constance in 1985 (p.9). Not so excusable, though, is the fact that the editors and contributors seem unaware of much earlier extensive literature on dialect contact and koine formation (summarized in Siegel 1985). In fact, they do not use the English term "koiné" as commonly found in sociolinguistic literature to refer to a dialect used for wider communication usually resulting from a mixture of features from dialects in contact. Instead, they use either the Greek word (either transliterated or in Greek orthography)—from which the term comes, of course—or German terms, such as *Ausgleichssprachen*, which are not widely known.

In conclusion, despite these shortcomings, this book is well worth reading (though perhaps not buying) for sociolinguists, and perhaps historical linguists, interested in language contact, variation and change. Although all readers may not be interested in the fine details of the studies, they would certainly find them valuable from the theoretical and methodological points of view.

References

- Le Page, Robert and Andrée Tabouret-Keller. 1985. *Acts of identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gumperz, John J. and Robert Wilson. 1971. Convergence and creolization. In *Pidginization and creolization of languages*, ed. by Dell Hymes, 151-67. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Siegel, Jeff. 1985. Koinés and koineization. *Language in Society* 14:357-378.

Trudgill, Peter. 1986. *Dialects in contact*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Linguistic theory and grammatical description. Current Issues in Linguistic Theory 75. Edited by Flip G. Droste and John E. Joseph. Amsterdam: Benjamins, 1991. 353 pp. US\$110.00

Reviewed by John R. Roberts
Summer Institute of Linguistics, Papua
New Guinea Branch

The editors of this book, Droste and Joseph (D&J), have assembled an excellent collection of essays on nine current linguistic theories. After an introduction in which D&J present their motivations and purposes for this volume and why these theories in particular should be included there is a chapter devoted to each theory. The nine theories presented are: Government and Binding Theory (GB), Relational Grammar (RG), Lexical Functional Grammar (LFG), Generalized Categorical Grammar: the Lambek Calculus (GCG), Logical Semantics (LS), Generalized Phrase Structure Grammar (GPSG), Functional Grammar (FG), Cognitive Grammar (CG), and Word Grammar (WG). The last three are presented by the originators of these particular theories: Simon Dik, Ronald Langacker and Richard Hudson respectively.

D&J maintain that Chomsky's transformational generative grammar (TGG) virtually defined the mainstream of linguistics in America and Europe from about 1964 to 1975. During this time its major challenger was one of its own off-shoots, known as

'generative semantics'. With the demise of generative semantics in the 1970s a whole range of competing linguistic theories arose to either take off from TGG in some other direction or to challenge TGG directly. D&J have therefore chosen these nine theories because they have been developed and have survived from the mid-1970s or later and also because they all have three characteristics which are common to the 'generative enterprise' of defining what human language is: (a) they are **universalistic** in approach, their goal being to define the phenomenon 'language' rather than to specify the make-up of one or more particular languages; (b) they are **mentalistic**, in that they aim at a description of deep-rooted regularities underlying linguistic activity in general; and (c) they incline towards the **algorithmic**, i.e. they seek a system of rules—or at least tendencies—explaining the operation of language in a finite series of well-described steps. In their coverage of the current linguistic scene D&J therefore leave out any theoretical approach that is not concordant with the general aims of generative grammar. So contemporary approaches to linguistic theory such as Systemic-Functional Grammar (Halliday) or Typological-Functional Grammar (Greenberg, Comrie, Givan, Bybee, etc.) are not included. Nevertheless, the book presents fairly concisely all the main formal approaches that are current in linguistic theory.

In the introduction D&J give an overview of what these different (formal) linguistic theories cover. For example, some have a syntactic base (e.g. GB, RG and LFG), some have a semantic base (e.g. GCG, LS and GPSG) and some have a pragmatic-cognitive base (e.g. FG, CG and WG). On p.19 D&J give a helpful chart